# Obstructions to Nielsen realization

Bena Tshishiku Math Congress of Americas July 26, 2017

Joint with Nick Salter

I. Realization problem for braid groups

 $B_n \coloneqq \langle \text{braids} \rangle$ 

 $B_n \coloneqq \langle \text{braids} \rangle$ 



a

 $B_n \coloneqq \langle \text{braids} \rangle \simeq \pi_1 \operatorname{Conf}_n(D^2)$ 



 $\boldsymbol{a}$ 

 $B_n \coloneqq \langle \text{braids} \rangle \simeq \pi_1 \operatorname{Conf}_n(D^2)$ 



 $B_n \coloneqq \langle \text{braids} \rangle \simeq \pi_1 \operatorname{Conf}_n(D^2) \simeq \pi_0 \operatorname{Diff}(D^2, n \text{ points})$ 



 $B_n \coloneqq \langle \text{braids} \rangle \simeq \pi_1 \operatorname{Conf}_n(D^2) \simeq \pi_0 \operatorname{Diff}(D^2, n \text{ points})$ 



 $B_n \coloneqq \langle \text{braids} \rangle \simeq \pi_1 \operatorname{Conf}_n(D^2) \simeq \pi_0 \operatorname{Diff}(D^2, n \text{ points})$ 



```
B_3 = \langle a, b \mid aba = bab \rangle
```

Question



# $\begin{array}{c} \operatorname{Diff}(D,n) \\ \pi \downarrow \\ \pi_0 \operatorname{Diff}(D,n) \end{array}$



# $\operatorname{Diff}(D,n)$ $\pi \downarrow$ $B_n \simeq \pi_0 \operatorname{Diff}(D,n)$



Does  $\sigma$  exist?

 $\pi \circ \sigma = \mathrm{id}$ 



E.g. (n = 3) Does there  $\exists F, G \in \text{Diff}(D, 3 \text{ points})$  s.t.



E.g. (n = 3) Does there  $\exists F, G \in \text{Diff}(D, 3 \text{ points})$  s.t. 1.  $F \sim \Phi_a, G \sim \Phi_b$  (isotopic)



E.g. (n = 3) Does there  $\exists F, G \in \text{Diff}(D, 3 \text{ points})$  s.t. 1.  $F \sim \Phi_a, G \sim \Phi_b$  (isotopic) 2.  $F \circ G \circ F = G \circ F \circ G$ ?









#### $B_n(S)$



 $\operatorname{Conf}_n(S) = \{(x_1, \dots, x_n) \mid x_i \in S, x_i \neq x_j \text{ for } i \neq j \} / S_n$ 

 $B_n(S)$ 

surface braid group:  $B_n(S) = \pi_1(\operatorname{Conf}_n(S))$ 

 $\operatorname{Conf}_n(S) = \{(x_1, \dots, x_n) \mid x_i \in S, x_i \neq x_j \text{ for } i \neq j \} / S_n$ 





 $B_n(S)$ 









 $\operatorname{Diff}(S, X_n)$  C<sup>1</sup> or. pres. diffeos,  $g|_{\partial S} = \operatorname{Id}$  and  $g(X_n) = X_n$ 



 $\operatorname{Diff}(S, X_n)$  C<sup>1</sup> or. pres. diffeos,  $g|_{\partial S} = \operatorname{Id}$  and  $g(X_n) = X_n$ 











Push = point-pushing homomorphism









If  $\sigma$  exists, say Push is realized by diffeomorphisms.



Evidence against



#### Evidence against

• <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto, 2009). S closed, genus  $\geq 2 \Rightarrow$ Push :  $\pi_1(S) \rightarrow Mod(S,*)$  not realized by diffeos.



#### Evidence against

- <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto, 2009). S closed, genus  $\geq 2 \Rightarrow$ Push :  $\pi_1(S) \rightarrow Mod(S,*)$  not realized by diffeos.
- <u>Theorem</u> (T, 2014). For every<sup>†</sup> semi-simple real Lie group G, there exists  $M = \Gamma \setminus G/K$  so that Push :  $\pi_1(M) \to \operatorname{Mod}(M,*)$  not realized by diffeos.
Does 
$$\sigma$$
 exist?  
 $B_n(S) \xrightarrow{\sigma} Mod(S, X_n)$ 

- <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto, 2009). S closed, genus  $\geq 2 \Rightarrow$ Push :  $\pi_1(S) \rightarrow Mod(S,*)$  not realized by diffeos.
- <u>Theorem</u> (T, 2014). For every<sup>†</sup> semi-simple real Lie group G, there exists  $M = \Gamma \setminus G/K$  so that Push :  $\pi_1(M) \to \operatorname{Mod}(M,*)$  not realized by diffeos.

<sup>†</sup> G  $\neq$  SO(n,1) for  $n \geq 3$ , but e.g. G = SL<sub>n</sub>(R), SU(n,1), E<sub>8(-24)</sub>





• <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto).  $S_g$  closed,  $g \ge 2$ ,  $n \ge 1 \Rightarrow$ Push not realized by diffeos.

Does 
$$\sigma$$
 exist?  
 $B_n(S) \xrightarrow{\sigma} Mod(S, X_n)$ 

- <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto).  $S_g$  closed,  $g \ge 2$ ,  $n \ge 1 \Rightarrow$ Push not realized by diffeos.
- <u>Theorem</u> (Morita). If  $g \ge 10$ , then

```
Diff (S_g) \rightarrow Mod(S_g) does not split.
```

Does 
$$\sigma$$
 exist?  
 $B_n(S) \xrightarrow{\sigma} \operatorname{Mod}(S, X_n)$ 

- <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto).  $S_g$  closed,  $g \ge 2$ ,  $n \ge 1 \Rightarrow$ Push not realized by diffeos.
- <u>Theorem</u> (Morita). If  $g \ge 10$ , then

 $\operatorname{Diff}(S_g)$   $\bigcup$  $\operatorname{Diff}^2(S_g) \twoheadrightarrow \operatorname{Mod}(S_g)$  does not split.



- <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto).  $S_g$  closed,  $g \ge 2$ ,  $n \ge 1 \Rightarrow$ Push not realized by diffeos.
- <u>Theorem</u> (Morita). If  $g \ge 10$ , then

Diff $(S_g)$ U Diff $^2(S_g)$ - $Mod(S_g)$  does not split.

Does 
$$\sigma$$
 exist?  
 $Does \sigma$  exist?  
 $B_n(S) \xrightarrow{\sigma} Mod(S,X_n)$   
Push  
Evidence against  
Evidence for

- <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto).  $S_g$  closed,  $g \ge 2$ ,  $n \ge 1 \Rightarrow$ Push not realized by diffeos.
- <u>Theorem</u> (Morita). If  $g \ge 10$ , then

 $\begin{array}{l} \operatorname{Diff}(S_g) \\ \cup \\ \operatorname{Diff}^2(S_g) \twoheadrightarrow \operatorname{Mod}(S_g) \text{ does not split.} \end{array}$ 

•  $\operatorname{Diff}(T^2) \twoheadrightarrow \operatorname{Mod}(T^2) \cong \operatorname{SL}(2,\mathbb{Z})$  splits.

Does 
$$\sigma$$
 exist?  
 $B_n(S) \xrightarrow{\sigma} Mod(S,X_n)$   
Evidence against  
 $Diff(S,X_n) \xrightarrow{\sigma} I_{\pi}$   
 $B_n(S) \xrightarrow{} Mod(S,X_n)$   
Evidence for

#### • <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto). $S_q$ closed, $g \ge 2$ , $n \ge 1 \Rightarrow$ Push not realized by diffeos.

Does

<u>Theorem</u> (Morita). If  $g \ge 10$ , then  $\bullet$ 

 $\operatorname{Diff}(S_g)$ IJ  $\operatorname{Diff}^2(S_q) \twoheadrightarrow \operatorname{Mod}(S_q)$  does not split.

- $\operatorname{Diff}(T^2) \twoheadrightarrow \operatorname{Mod}(T^2) \simeq \operatorname{SL}(2,\mathbb{Z})$  splits.
- <u>Corollary</u> (Thurston).  $\operatorname{Diff}(D,X_3) \to \operatorname{Mod}(D,X_3) \simeq B_3$  splits.

Does 
$$\sigma$$
 exist?  
 $Does \sigma$  exist?  
 $B_n(S) \xrightarrow{\sigma} Mod(S,X_n)$   
Push  
Evidence against  
Evidence for

#### Evidence a

- <u>Theorem</u> (Bestvina-Church-Souto).  $S_q$  closed,  $g \ge 2$ ,  $n \ge 1 \Rightarrow$ Push not realized by diffeos.
- <u>Theorem</u> (Morita). If  $g \ge 10$ , then  $\operatorname{Diff}(S_q)$ IJ  $\operatorname{Diff}^2(S_q) \twoheadrightarrow \operatorname{Mod}(S_q)$  does not split.

- $\operatorname{Diff}(T^2) \twoheadrightarrow \operatorname{Mod}(T^2) \cong \operatorname{SL}(2,\mathbb{Z})$  splits.
- <u>Corollary</u> (Thurston).  $\operatorname{Diff}(D,X_3) \to \operatorname{Mod}(D,X_3) \simeq B_3$  splits.
- <u>Theorem</u> (Nariman).  $\operatorname{Diff}(D \setminus X_n) \twoheadrightarrow \operatorname{Mod}(D, X_n) \simeq B_n$  splits cohomologically.





<u>Theorem</u> (Salter-T, 2015). S compact, genus  $\geq 0$ . For  $n \geq 6$ , Push is not realized by diffeomorphisms.



For  $n \geq 6$ , Push is not realized by diffeomorphisms.



<u>Theorem</u> (Salter-T, 2015). S compact, genus  $\geq 0$ . For  $n \geq 6$ , Push is not realized by diffeomorphisms.

<u>Example</u>. Diff $(D, X_n) \twoheadrightarrow B_n$  does not split for  $n \ge 6$ .



<u>Theorem</u> (Salter-T, 2015). S compact, genus  $\geq 0$ . For  $n \geq 6$ , Push is not realized by diffeomorphisms.

<u>Example</u>. Diff $(D, X_n) \twoheadrightarrow B_n$  does not split for  $n \ge 6$ .

<u>Corollary</u> (of proof). S closed, genus  $\geq 2$ . Then Diff(S)  $\rightarrow$  Mod(S) does not split.

### Aside: Flat surface bundles

<u>Open Question</u>. Does there exist  $S_g \to E \to S_h$  not flat?

### Aside: Flat surface bundles

<u>Open Question</u>. Does there exist  $S_g \to E \to S_h$  not flat?

Equivalently, does there exist  $\rho$  that has no lift?



# II. Proof of Main Theorem

# Main theorem $\operatorname{Diff}(S, X_n)$ $\sqrt{\pi}$ $B_n(S) \longrightarrow Mod(S, X_n)$ Push

<u>Theorem</u> (Salter-T, 2015). S compact, genus  $\geq 0$ . For  $n \geq 6$ , Push is not realized by diffeomorphisms.

<u>Theorem</u> (Thurston). Fix a manifold (M,x). The group

<u>Theorem</u> (Thurston). Fix a manifold (M,x). The group  $\text{Diff}(M,T_xM) = \{ g \mid g(x) = x, (dg)_x = \text{id} \}$ 

Theorem (Thurston). Fix a manifold (M,x). The group  $Diff(M, T_x M) = \{ g \mid g(x) = x, (dg)_x = id \}$ is locally indicable,

Theorem (Thurston). Fix a manifold (M,x). The group Diff(M, T<sub>x</sub>M) = { g | g(x) = x, (dg)<sub>x</sub> = id } is locally indicable,
i.e. for every finitely generated Γ < Diff(M, T<sub>x</sub>M), there exists surjection Γ → Z.

Theorem (Thurston). Fix a manifold (M,x). The group Diff(M, T<sub>x</sub>M) = { g | g(x) = x, (dg)<sub>x</sub> = id } is locally indicable,
i.e. for every finitely generated Γ < Diff(M, T<sub>x</sub>M), there exists surjection Γ → Z.

#### Strategy

Show:

Theorem (Thurston). Fix a manifold (M,x). The group Diff(M, T<sub>x</sub>M) = { g | g(x) = x, (dg)<sub>x</sub> = id } is locally indicable,
i.e. for every finitely generated Γ < Diff(M, T<sub>x</sub>M), there exists surjection Γ → Z.

 $\begin{array}{ll} \underline{Strategy}\\ \text{Show:} & B_n(S) \xrightarrow{\sigma} \mathrm{Diff}(S, X_n) \implies\\ & \text{exists} \end{array}$ 

Theorem (Thurston). Fix a manifold (M,x). The group Diff(M, T<sub>x</sub>M) = { g | g(x) = x, (dg)<sub>x</sub> = id } is locally indicable,
i.e. for every finitely generated Γ < Diff(M, T<sub>x</sub>M), there exists surjection Γ → Z.

 $\begin{array}{lll} \underline{Strategy} & \operatorname{Diff}(S, T_x S) \text{ contains} \\ \mathrm{Show:} & B_n(S) \xrightarrow{\sigma} \operatorname{Diff}(S, X_n) \implies \text{ f.g. perfect subgroup} \\ & \text{exists} & \Gamma = [\Gamma, \Gamma]. \end{array}$ 

### Proof idea: Perfect subgroup

## Proof idea: Perfect subgroup

Note:  $B_n$  not perfect.

#### Proof idea: Perfect subgroup Note: $B_n$ not perfect. $\langle \sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_{n-1} \rangle$ $||_{B_n \to \mathbb{Z}}$

#### Proof idea: Perfect subgroup Note: $B_n$ not perfect. $\langle \sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_{n-1} \rangle$ || $B_n \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}$ $\sigma_i \mapsto 1$

#### Proof idea: Perfect subgroup Note: $B_n$ not perfect. $\langle \sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_{n-1} \rangle$ || $1 \rightarrow [B_n, B_n] \rightarrow B_n \rightarrow \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow 1$ $\sigma_i \mapsto 1$

## Proof idea: Perfect subgroup $\langle \sigma_1, \ldots, \sigma_{n-1} \rangle$ Note: $B_n$ not perfect. $1 \rightarrow |B_n, B_n| \rightarrow B_n \rightarrow \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow 1$ $\sigma_i \mapsto 1$ e.g. $\sigma_1 = \bigwedge | \dots |$ not a commutator, but $\sigma_1 \sigma_2^{-1} = \bigvee \bigvee \bigcup \cdots \bigcup$ is a commutator.

## Proof idea: Perfect subgroup $\langle \sigma_1 \, , \, ... \, , \, \sigma_{n-1} \, \rangle$ Note: $B_n$ not perfect. $1 \rightarrow |B_n, B_n| \rightarrow B_n \rightarrow \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow 1$ $\sigma_i \mapsto 1$ e.g. $\sigma_1 = \bigwedge | \dots |$ not a commutator, but $\sigma_1 \sigma_2^{-1} = \bigwedge \bigwedge \biggr| \cdots \biggr|$ is a commutator. $\sigma_1 \sigma_2 r^{-1} = [\sigma_2 r^{-1}, \sigma_1 r^{-1}] = [\sigma_4 \sigma_2 r^{-1}, \sigma_4 \sigma_1 r^{-1}]$

# Proof idea: Perfect subgroup $\langle \sigma_1, \ldots, \sigma_{n-1} \rangle$ Note: $B_n$ not perfect. $1 \rightarrow [B_n, B_n] \rightarrow B_n \rightarrow \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow 1$ $\sigma_i \mapsto 1$ e.g. $\sigma_1 = \bigwedge | \dots |$ not a commutator, but $\sigma_1 \sigma_2^{-1} = \bigvee \bigvee \bigcup \cdots \bigcup$ is a commutator. $\sigma_1 \sigma_2 r^{-1} = [\sigma_2 r^{-1}, \sigma_1 r^{-1}] = [\sigma_4 \sigma_2 r^{-1}, \sigma_4 \sigma_1 r^{-1}]$

<u>Theorem</u> (Gorin-Lin). For  $n \ge 5$ ,  $[B_n, B_n]$  is f.g. perfect group.

Thank you.

#### <u>Corollary</u> (Thurston). Diff $(D,X_3) \rightarrow Mod(D,X_3) \approx B_3$ splits.
$SL_2(Z) \land \bigcirc \bigcirc$ 

 $SL_2(Z) \land () \bigcirc$ 





 $1 \rightarrow Z \rightarrow B_3 \rightarrow PSL_2(Z) \rightarrow 1$ 







Homotope x|a, y|a to identity preserving relation  $x^2 = y^3$ .